

3 1761 03348 8693

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

J E W I S H   L A W

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

1990

387  
W45  
1770

LAW LIBRARY  
SEP 6 1990  
FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

J E W I S H   L A W

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

1990



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/jewishlaw00wein>

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE #
I. The Sources of Jewish Law .....	1
Goldbenberg, Talmud .....	1
A Talmudic Example: Babylonian Talmud, Kiddushin 49a ("Words in the heart are not words.") .....	18
Wieseltier, Unlocking the Rabbis' Secrets .....	22
II. Mitsvot: Jewish Law as a Jurisprudence of Obligation .....	24
A. The Nature of "Mitzvah"	
Leibowitz, Commandments .....	24
Cover, Obligation: A Jewish Jurisprudence of the Social Order .....	34
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 86b .....	43
B. The Example of Unconscionability	
Leviticus 25.1-17 .....	45
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 49b .....	46
Hegel, Philosophy of Right, s. 77 .....	60
Benson, Abstract Right and the Possibility of a Nondistributive Conception of Contract .....	61
C. The Example of Rescue	
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 73a .....	67
Weinrib, Right and Advantage in Private Law .....	76
Fletcher, Defensive Force as an Act of Rescue .....	83
Weinrib, Rescue and Restitution .....	91
III. The Rationality of Jewish Law .....	99
A. Hukkim and Mishpatim	
Leviticus 19.19 .....	99
Deuteronomy 22.11 .....	99
Babylonian Talmud, Yoma 67b .....	99
B. Saadya Gaon	
Saadya, The Book of Doctrines and Beliefs .....	100
C. Maimonides	
Maimonides, Guide to the Perplexed .....	122
Maimonides, Book of Commandments .....	159
Twersky, An Introduction to the Code of Maimonides 453 .....	160



IV. Legal Method .....	165
A. Reading the Bible	
1. What is "Reading"?	
Fried, Sonnet LXV and the "Black Ink" of the Framers' Intention	165
Dworkin, How to Read the Civil Rights Act .....	175
Fish, Is There a Text in This Class? .....	187
Goldin, Of Change and Adaptation in Judaism .....	199
2. Purposive Interpretation	
Deuteronomy 17, 14-17 .....	205
Deuteronomy 24, 17-18 .....	205
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 115a .....	206
3. Some Examples	
(a) How Many is Forty?	
Deuteronomy 25, 1-3 .....	207
Babylonian Talmud, Makkot 22a .....	207
(b) An Eye for an Eye	
Exodus 21, 22-25 .....	209
Leviticus 24, 17-22 .....	209
Numbers 36, 30-34 .....	209
Deuteronomy 19, 15-21 .....	210
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 83a .....	211
B. Innovation	
1. "And Where Did He Command Us?"	
Babylonian Talmud, Shabbat 23a .....	217
Deuteronomy 17, 8-13 .....	218
Deuteronomy 32, 7 .....	218
2. "Uprooting Something from the Torah"	
Babylonian Talmud, Yebamoth 89b .....	219
Roth, The Halakhic Process: A Systemic Analysis 185-193	225
Deuteronomy 15, 1-11 .....	233
Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 34b, 36a .....	234
Silberg, Talmudic Law and the Modern State 22-28, 37-40	236

3. "Do not Add or Take Away"

Deuteronomy 4, 2 .....	243
Deuteronomy 13, 1 .....	243
Babylonian Talmud, Rosh Hashanah 28b .....	244
Roth, The Halakhic Process: A Systematic Analysis 156	246

C. Legal Reasoning

1. Considerations that Stand to Reason (S'vara)

Babylonian Talmud, Berachot 35a .....	256
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 74a .....	257
Babylonian Talmud, Yevamot 35b .....	258

2. Conceptualism and Casuistry

Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 72a .....	259
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 26a .....	260
<u>Home Office v. Dorset Yacht</u> (Lord Diplock) .....	264

3. Right Answers

Dworkin, Is There Really No Right Answer in Hard Cases?	269
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 59a .....	291
Babylonian Talmud, Erubin 13b .....	295

D. Writing and Codification

Dorff and Rosett, A Living Tree: The Roots and Growth of Jewish Law, 366 .....	297
Maimonides, Introduction to the Mishneh Torah .....	305
R. Abraham ben David of Posquieres, Comment on Introduction to the Mishneh Torah .....	310
R. Hayyim Bar Bezalel, Vikkuah Mayyim Hayyim .....	311

An Example: Unintentional Killing

Deuteronomy 19, 1-13 .....	312
Babylonian Talmud, Makkot 7a .....	315
Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Murder and the Preservation of Life, Chapter 6 .....	317

The Problem More Generally Considered:

Hegel, The Philosophy of Right, s. 211 .....	320
Plato, Phaedrus 274 .....	322
Husserl, The Origins of Geometry .....	326

E.	Jewish Legal Method: The Classic Statement	
	Maimonides, Introduction to the Commentary on the Mishnah .....	342
IV.	Some Contemporary Problems .....	357
A.	Abortion	
1.	Basic Texts	
	Exodus 21, 22-24 .....	357
	Mishnah, Oholot 7, 6 .....	357
	Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 57b .....	357
	Rashi's comment on "Even for Fetuses" .....	358
	Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 59a .....	358
	Tosafot on Sanhedrin 59a .....	358
	Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 72b .....	359
	Rashi's comment on "If his head has emerged" .....	359
	Maimonides, Laws of Murder and the Preservation of Life, Chapter 1 .....	359
	Deuteronomy 25, 7 .....	360
	Babylonian Talmud, Arakin 7a .....	361
	Babylonian Talmud, Niddah 44a .....	363
	Tosafot's commentary on "he dies first" .....	363
2.	Interpretations and Controversies	
	Biale, Women and Jewish Law 219 .....	364
	Halibard, Abortion in Jewish Law: A Recent Judgment ..	378
	Sinclair, Law and Morality in Halakhic Bioethics, Appendix: The Tay-Sachs Fetus Debate .....	390
B.	Divorce	
1.	The Biblical Basis	
	Deuteronomy 24, 1-4 .....	395
2.	The Grounds for Divorce	
(a)	"Some Unseemly Thing"	
	Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 90a .....	395
(b)	Smells, Boils, and Other Offensive Conditions	
	Babylonian Talmud, Ketuboth 77a .....	398
	Biale, Women and Jewish Law 92-96 .....	402



(c) "He is repulsive to me"

Babylonian Talmud, Ketuboth 63b .....	405
Responsum of Rav Sherira Gaon .....	407
Riskin, Women and Jewish Divorce 75-77 .....	409
Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, The Laws of Marital Status, 14, 8 .....	411
Riskin, Women and Jewish Divorce 93-111 .....	413
Gartner, Review of Riskin, Women and Jewish Divorce .....	426
Another Example of the Jurisprudence of Rabbenu Tam: Tosafot on Sanhedrin 74b .....	432

(d) Compelling the Husband to Grant the Divorce

Babylonian Talmud, Baba Bathra 47b .....	435
Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Divorce, Chapter 1 .....	436
Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Divorce, Chapter 2 .....	438

3. The Agunah ("The Anchored Woman")

(a) The Problem in Jewish Law

Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 32a .....	439
Warshofsky, The Recalcitrant Husband .....	441

(b) The Intervention of Non-Jewish Law

Morris v. Morris (1973), 36 D.L.R. 3d 447 (Man. Q.B.) .....	459
Morris v. Morris (1973), 42 D.L.R. 3d 550 (Man. C.A.) .....	467
Avitzur v. Avitzur, 58 N.Y. 2d 158 (C.A. 1983) .....	486
Family Law Act, S.O. 1986, c. 4, s. 2 .....	495
Whyte, Memorandum of Law .....	496
An Act to Amend the Divorce Act (Barriers to Religious Remarriage) .....	502

